

Community Benefit Ordinance: Timeline

July 2022: Formed internal City Hall working group

- Working group has met every other week for the past 4 months (see Appendix A for list of members)

September 2022: City Council passed [Res. No. 954-2022](#)

- “Establishing a working committee of Council, the Mayor’s Administration, and community stakeholders to study Community Benefit Agreement policies and ordinances and consider implementing a City policy and ordinance to ensure that development projects provide maximized tangible benefits to Cleveland’s communities and citizens; and improve reporting practices and public accessibility to workforce and community benefits data and information.”

October 2022: Construction industry stakeholder focus groups (see Appendix B for list of attendees)

- 3 focus groups, ~90 total participants
- Received surveys from 62 participants
 - 100% said “yes,” the focus group was a good use of their time
 - 98% would be interested in participating in conversations like this in the future
- Qualitative feedback from participant surveys
 - “Thank you, keep asking for participation.”
 - “We must invest in our people, communities and organizations using unconventional and non-traditional methodologies.”
 - “Came into this session feeling like I had little to contribute but ultimately found it an enlightening discussion.”
 - “Good dialogue around a very complex topic.”
 - “Feeling optimistic and ready to participate where I can add value.”
 - “This is a GREAT start to the CBA conversation. Grateful to be a part of the conversation.”
 - “This is a good way to be strategic in coming up with a good, flexible CBA.”

November-December 2022: Community engagement

- Attending community meetings and distributing a survey to community members through Council Member newsletters and social media, consulting with other community organizations (CNP/CDCs, Urban League, NAACP, Northeast Ohio Hispanic Center for Economic Development, etc.).
- Survey may be completed via online form submission or phone.

March 2023: Introduce Community Benefit Ordinance and Construction Reform Charter Amendment Ordinance

- Construction Reform will require an amendment to Charter Section 167, Public Improvements. Under Charter Section 200, Council must pass an ordinance submitting the proposed Charter amendment to electors at a special election held 60-120 days after passage.

Goal for May 2023: Construction Reform Charter Amendment proposal to appear on May 2nd Special Election ballot (confirming special election date).

How will this impact developers and construction industry stakeholders?

- The CBO is intended to manage the tension between flexibility and predictability for developers by creating expectations for developers should they request city financial incentives.
- Both the CBO and Construction Reform Charter Amendment Ordinance will aid in providing additional opportunities for MBE/FBE/CSBs to grow their businesses and local workforce and will make the delivery methods for construction projects more efficient and effective.

What is Construction Reform?

- Expands optimal project delivery systems for public improvement projects, projects owned by the city
- Creates more efficient methods and transparent processes for construction and building
- Removes opportunities for corruption and greatly enhances and incentivizes the opportunity for inclusion
- Helps to get a better quality of contractors at the sub-contractor level.
- Allows the city to select based on best value, not just lowest price

How will this impact the community? Why is it necessary?

- The CBO will provide a consistent avenue to community members to be involved in development projects happening in their neighborhoods - neighborhoods they themselves have invested in.
- The CBO intends to further workforce development in the skilled trades, offering residents career opportunities and living-wage jobs.

What other cities are doing to increase equitable development

- **Columbus, OH** introduced a Community Benefit Ordinance that applies to City-owned building development projects over \$5 million. The ordinance establishes a Community Benefits Advisory Committee with the narrow scope of reviewing City-owned building development projects and recommending CBAs to the Mayor's Office.
- **Detroit, MI** passed a Community Benefit Ordinance for private development projects over \$75 million. The ordinance largely establishes a community engagement strategy through the use of Neighborhood Advisory Committees.
- **Philadelphia, PA** has an "informal" CBA process that has not been codified but is set through internal policy: CBA requirement is triggered through zoning variances and land transfers. The city is not a party to CBAs. Separately, the city implemented a construction impact tax, which uses the revenue for community investment projects and mandatory inclusionary zoning, which requires residential developers to include 10-20% of affordable units.
- **St. Louis, MO** is developing an Economic Justice Action Plan through the St. Louis Development Corporation, which lays out priorities for how resources should be allocated for development projects and uses a new scorecard for awarding city incentives.
- The **Massachusetts Port Authority (Massport)** developed a policy that created a decision-making guideline on a 100-point scale that contained 4 equally-weighted criteria which included: 1) ability to execute the project, 2) viability of ground rent proposal and finance plan, 3) comprehensive diversity and inclusion program in all aspects of the development (financing, design, construction, and ownership/investment), and 4) exceptional design and program. This policy shows what's possible for Cleveland to accomplish with Construction Reform.

Appendix A

Community Benefits Working Group Members

City Council

Blaine Griffin, Council President, Ward 6
Kerry McCormack, Ward 3
Anthony Hairston, Ward 10
Jasmin Santana, Ward 14
Jennifer Heinert O’Leary, Special Counsel
Steven Rys, Special Assistant to Council
Joan Mazzolini, Chief of Communications
Darryle Torbert, Director of Communications
Jessica Colombi, Director, Policy & Research
Brook Sabin, Policy Analyst
Ibukun Ode-Martins, Public Service Fellow
Siân Payne, Public Service Fellow

Mayor’s Administration

Justin Bibb, Mayor
Jeff Epstein, Chief of Integrated Development
Bonnie Teeuwen, Chief Operating Officer
Tyson Mitchell, Director, Office of Equal Opportunity
Tessa Jackson, Director, Economic Development
Angela Shute-Woodson, Director, Community Relations
Alyssa Hernandez, Director, Community Development
Michiel Wackers, Assistant Director, Community Development
Michelle Rose, Executive Director, Cuyahoga County-Cleveland Workforce Development Board
Gretchen Blackwell, Public Service Fellow
Peighton Taylor, Public Service Fellow

Greater Cleveland Partnership

Baiju Shah, President and CEO
Marty McGann, Executive Vice President, Advocacy and Strategy
Patrice Blakemore, Senior Vice President, Equity & Inclusion
Chris Nance, Vice President, Construction and Inclusive Talent

Appendix B

Construction Industry Stakeholder Focus Group Attendees

Vanessa Whiting, A.E.S. Management Corp.
Anne Richie, ACR Capital
Adrian Maldonado, Adrian Maldonado & Associates
Chelsea Maldonado, Adrian Maldonado & Associates
Shariq Ali, Algebra AEC
Esbeey Madera, All Phase General Construction
Joe Lopez, Artessa Building Group
Deb Janik, Bedrock Detroit
Justin Bahri, Bedrock Detroit
Nadia Sesay, Bedrock Detroit
Dennis Kramer, City of Cleveland
David Jenkins, Cleveland Browns
Pat Rios, Cleveland Clinic
Jessica Coffey, Cleveland Development Advisors
William A Willis, Cleveland Development Advisors
Yvette Ittu, Cleveland Development Advisors
Keisha M. Gonzalez, Cleveland Foundation
Matt Grimes, Cleveland Guardians
Neil Weiss, Cleveland Guardians
Adam Trumbo, Cleveland Neighborhood Progress
Edward Stockhausen, Cleveland Neighborhood Progress
Kwame Botchway, Cleveland Neighborhood Progress
Matthew Kibbon, Cleveland State University
Lonnie Coleman, Coleman Spohn Corporation
Keith Laschinger, Construction Employers Association
Alfred Fenderson, Construction Employers| Contractors Assistance
Glen Shumate, Construction Employers| Contractors Assistance
David Smith, Construction Smith Inc.
Richard Yost Pace, Cumberland Development
Cynthia D Leitson, Cuyahoga Community College
Ricardo Leon, Cuyahoga Land Bank
Jeffery K Patterson, Cuyahoga Metropolitan Housing Authority
Jeffrey Meyers, DS Architecture
Ayonna Blue Donald, Enterprise Community Partners
Akil Hameed, FASS Management Real Estate Services
Stephanie Turner, FASS Management Real Estate Services
Kyle Merrill, Gilbane Building Company
Travis A Okel, Gilbane Building Company
Mark D. Cunningham, Gilbane Building Company
Evan Chwalek, Global Cleveland
Joe Cimperman, Global Cleveland
Autumn Russell, Greater Cleveland Career Consortium
David Ebersole, Greater Cleveland Partnership
Marty McGann, Greater Cleveland Partnership
Mike Glavin, Greater Cleveland Partnership

Clarence Day, Griffin Moor International, LLP
Michael Jeans, Growth Opps & GO Green Energy Fund
Philip Dangerfield, Haslam Sports Group
Ted Tywang, Haslam Sports Group
Jose Feliciano Jr., Hispanic Roundtable
Omar Elhagmusa, IFF
Bridget Topazia Grant, Management Services Partners
DeJuan Washington, Management Services Partners
Chris Howse, National Association of Minority Contractors Northern Ohio Chapter
Lisa Bottoms, National Association of Minority Contractors Northern Ohio Chapter
Shakorie Davis, Next Generation Construction
Jenice Contreras, Northeast Ohio Hispanic Center for Economic Development
Tiffany Jordan, Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District
Michelle Rose, Ohio Means Jobs
Dominic Ozanne, Ozanne Construction Company
Rhoni Thompson, R.L.Cole Ent., Inc,
Sandra Madison, Robert P. Madison International, Inc.
Timothy Offtermatt, Rock & Roll Hall of Fame
Zoe Ingram, Rock & Roll Hall of Fame
Antony Bonavita, Rocket Mortgage FieldHouse / Cleveland Cavaliers
Brian Linick, Sherwin Williams
Jeffrey Appelbaum, Thompson Hine LLP / Project Management Consultants LLC
W. Daniel Bickerstaff, II, Ubiquitous Design, LTD
Dean Vaughn, University Hospitals - Sodexo
Goren Dillard, Urban League of Greater Cleveland
Dione Alexander, Village Capital Corporation
Marvin Echols, Whiting-Turner
Phil Kerber, Whiting-Turner